

**Minutes of Meeting of the Judiciary Committee on Sindh RoL (Rule of Law)
Roadmap, August 18, 2018, 4th Meeting**

In Attendance:

From Sindh Judicial Academy:

1. Former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan Mr. Justice Khilji Arif Hussain, former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan, Honorable Director General, Sindh Judicial Academy
2. Former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan Mr. Justice Ghulam Rabbani, former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan
3. Honorable Mr. Justice Ali Aslam Jafri, Consultant, Sindh Judicial Academy
4. Ms. Nuzhat Ara Alvi, Senior Most District & Sessions Judge, Senior Faculty Member, Sindh Judicial Academy
5. Mr. Muhammad Shahid Shafiq, District & Sessions Judge, Senior Faculty Member, Sindh Judicial Academy
6. Mr. Ashok Kumar Dodeja, District & Sessions Judge, Mediator Sindh Judicial Academy
7. Mr. Mohammad Murtaza Khan, I.T Expert/Faculty Member, Sindh Judicial Academy

From GIZ:

1. Mr. Niaz Ahmed Siddiki, Former Inspector General Police Sindh
2. Mr. Muhammad Ali Nekokara, Consultant GIZ
3. Mr. Iqbal Ahmed Detho, Consultant GIZ
4. Mr. Muhammad Afzal Shaikh, Technical Advisor
5. Mr. Manzoor Hussain Memon, Consultant GIZ
6. Mr. Usama Ahmed, Consultant GIZ

From High Court of Sindh:

1. Mr. Abdul Razzak, District & Sessions Judges, MIT-II High Court of Sindh with Mr. Juned Ahmed, Civil Judge/Judicial Magistrate

From Legal Aid Society:

1. Ms. Haya Zahid
2. Ms. Menaal Munshey

Agenda:

- To consider the steps taken for data collection regarding public perception regarding justice system
- To review the progress made so far in designing the Roadmap
- To review the first draft of the Roadmap prepared so far

The Proceedings:

- On the request of Mr. Muhammad Shahid Shafiq, District & Sessions Judge, Senior Faculty Member, Sindh Judicial Academy, Mr. Niaz Ahmed Siddiki initiated the proceedings. He

continued on next page...

thanked the Hon'ble Judges for their kind participation in the Rule of Law conference held on August 06, 2018 at PC Bhurban-Murree.

- Honorable Mr. Justice Khilji Arif Hussain, Former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan, Director General, Sindh Judicial Academy thanked Mr. Siddiqui former IG Sindh and requested him to share the work completed so far in order to enable Judicial Committee to the extend of some suggestions. Mr. Niaz Siddiki shared that GIZ has hired the services of Legal Aid Society in order to get litigants perception on criminal justice system. In this regard, MoU has also been signed between the **two** organizations. Mr. Siddiki added that the result of the assignment would be shared in the next meeting.
- During the meeting, Ms. Haya Zahid delivered presentation on Mainstreaming Citizen Needs. She shared that the data of about 55,000 litigants was available at LAS; this data was collected by means of the call center established by LAS. She also shared that they have to developed a questionnaire on the basis of thematic concerns, that is, accessibility of justice services, efficiency of police responses to crimes, effectiveness of police investigation and admissibility of forensic evidence in criminal cases, fairness of criminal procedure and judicial litigation, grievance redress, transparency and accountability to citizens, role and challenges of CSOs to reform criminal justice sector etc.
- In her presentation, she also elaborated the process of sampling and its methodology in suggested Statistical Analysis. Describing 'Perceptions of Police Legitimacy', Ms. Zahid shared that for maintaining the versatility and flexibility of data collection, the questionnaires would be designed adopting both open-ended and closed-ended techniques.
- Honorable Director General, Sindh Judicial Academy suggested to include women in the perception survey and it was decided that 1/3rd of the calls would be made to the women and stated that that the Committee of Judiciary is very keen to know the progress of draft of rule of law roadmap.
- Mr. Niaz Siddiki informed that the first draft of the RoL roadmap would be developed by August 31, 2018.
- Mr. Muhammad Ali Nekokara shared that they collecting huge data without its analysis. He also shared that they are facing some difficulties in collecting data related to prosecution and sentencing. Besides, some data from police and judiciary is also needed to finalize the roadmap draft.
- Director General Sindh Judicial Academy shared that the forum could collect valuable information from the participants of ongoing training of Prosecutors at the Academy. He also shared that these Prosecutors were from several Districts of Sindh.

continued on next page...

- Honorable Mr. Justice Ghulam Rabbani, former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan emphasized to consider the ground realities of over-burdened situation of cases on the Judges and suggested to have specialized Judges for Civil and Criminal cases with properly administered segregation.
- Mr. Abdul Razzak, District & Sessions Judge, MIT-II High Court of Sindh, stated that Honorable Mr. Justice Sarmad Jalal Usmani, former Chief Justice High Court of Sindh had already executed a similar activity of segregation of cases during his tenure.
- Mr. Niaz Ahmed Siddiki delivered a presentation on progress of 'Rule of Law Roadmap' Sindh. He explained the background and strategy and shared the brief context of Rule of Law in Sindh, its background, strategic framework and the methodology. Elaborating the diagnostics, he shared that the institutional assessments and Criminal Justice System institutions including Police, Prosecution, Judiciary, Prisons, Reclamation & Probation, Bar Councils and Associations etc. would be done on narrative and graphics (tables, charts, etc.) on the basis of historical background; legal framework; organizational structure; human resources; infrastructure and capital resources; financial resources; capacity; external linkages; performance management and accountability. Defining the features of Roadmap, Mr. Siddiki shared the prioritized initiatives tied to specific indicators at the Objective level: for the short (End of Year One), medium (End of Year Three) and long terms (End of Five Year), and also explicated the implementation strategy, that is, project tasks, responsibilities, and timelines of the roadmap.
- Mr. Muhammad Shahid Shafiq shared that in-house administered specialized proceedings which are in practice. He also suggested to distinguish between the citizens' perception and litigant while designing the roadmap.
- Mr. Niaz Ahmed Siddiki suggested to have a next meeting on September 15, 2018.

Conclusion:

- Honorable Mr. Justice Khilji Arif Hussain thanked the delegation. He said that the date of next meeting would be shared soon.
- It was decided that GIZ will share the questionnaire of litigant's perception being developed by Legal Aid Society.
- It was also agreed that GIZ will share the first draft of roadmap (related with Judiciary) with SJA for feedback.

continued on next page...

Sindh Judicial Academy:

1. Honorable Mr. Justice Khilji Arif Hussain, former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan,
Honorable Director General, Sindh Judicial Academy
2. Honorable Mr. Justice Ghulam Rabbani, former Judge Supreme Court of Pakistan
3. Honorable Mr. Justice Ali Aslam Jafri, Consultant, Sindh Judicial Academy
4. Ms. Nuzhat Ara Alvi, Senior Most District & Sessions Judge, Senior Faculty Member, Sindh
Judicial Academy
5. Mr. Muhammad Shahid Shafiq, District & Sessions Judge, Senior Faculty Member, Sindh
Judicial Academy

High Court of Sindh:

1. Mr. Abdul Razzak, District & Sessions Judges, MIT-II High Court of Sindh

GIZ:

1. Mr. Niaz Ahmed Siddiki, Former Inspector General Police
2. Mr. Muhammad Ali Nekokara, Consultant GIZ
3. Mr. Iqbal Ahmed Detho, Consultant GIZ
4. Mr. Muhammad Afzal Shaikh, Technical Advisor
5. Mr. Manzoor Hussain Memon, Consultant GIZ
6. Mr. Usama Ahmed, Consultant GIZ